



**SPECIAL MEETING
THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
THURSDAY MAY 11, 2006
COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, AZ**

MINUTES

PRESENT: Ed Wimmer, Chairman
George Hartz, Vice-Chairman
Paul Winslow, Commissioner
DeeJaye Lockwood, Commissioner

ABSENT: Nancy Dallett, Commissioner
Kathy Howard, Commissioner
Dezbah Hatathli, Commissioner

STAFF: Don Meserve
Debbie Abele

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order by Chairman Wimmer at 5:32 p.m.

1. Introductions, Welcome New Commissioner and Roll Call

A roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

Chairman Wimmer introduced the new Commissioner, DeeJaye Lockwood.

2. Minutes: April 10, 2006 Special Meeting

COMMISSIONER WINSLOW MOVED TO ACCEPT THE MINUTES OF THE APRIL 10, 2006 MEETING. SECONDED BY VICE-CHAIRMAN HARTZ, THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF FOUR (4) TO ZERO (0).

3. **Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Draft Garden Apartment District Designation Report and Outreach Plans**

Ms. Abele noted that this area was being looked at in the way that SHPO (State Historic Preservation Officer) uses, as a concentration of eligible multi-family properties being eligible for historic designation. She explained that a multiple-property listing or thematic district report would be written depicting what influence creates the garden apartments and proposed to designating related properties individually. The proposed approach would be beneficial for this area since some of the projects within a potential historic district boundary are non-contributing or ineligible. She noted that one garden apartment is no longer a contributor due to the recent demolition of two one-story buildings. Another property on 68th Street recently received approval from the Development Review Board (DRB) for alterations.

Ms. Abele proposed beginning a series of meetings with property owners for each apartment/condominium project to ascertain which ones are interested, noting that some owners have already inquired about being designated. She recommended doing an overall thematic nomination and designating one or two projects in the same fashion that has been used with the neighborhoods.

Commissioner Winslow expressed strong opposition to this approach. He had a concern that when an area with a certain amount of density that may not remain as a neighborhood is designated this way, it would hammerlock the City for other development. This could ultimately lead to their decimation. He suggested choosing three or four of the most characteristic apartment complexes and focusing on those to enhance the probability of their survival.

Chairman Wimmer concurred that he too did not feel comfortable with the proposed approach. He noted that this type of overlay does not specify everything in a district, which could set a dangerous precedent for single-family neighborhoods. He agreed with Commissioner Winslow and noted support for choosing the best properties and if they coincide with supportive ownership moving as quickly as possible.

Ms. Abele clarified that the Historic Register Committee and SHPO have concurred that these multi-family properties are National Registry eligible; they were looked at as a collection. She stated that the normal community meetings would be held before an initiation, noting that they would need to be held with each individual apartment/condominium community's HOA. The majority of the properties are condominiums with property owners associations. She confirmed that the meetings discussing legal issues could be held as a larger district area, but the initial ones answering questions should be individual complexes.

In response to Chairman Wimmer, Ms. Abele clarified that the Historic Register Committee made their recommendations. If the Commission does not want all twelve complexes designated, they can request that the Committee chose the top few, or the Commission can choose the ones they think are most eligible and proceed with considering those for designation.

Addressing a concern of Mr. Winslow, Ms. Abele noted that the best protections against redevelopment or major changes are associated with condominiums, due to the form of multiple ownership.

Vice-Chairman Hartz suggested that a tour of the area be arranged, because a number of the Commissioners have not had an opportunity to see the properties. Ms. Abele confirmed that staff would conduct a walking tour of this few block area.

Mr. Meserve clarified that staff was interested in developing a draft designation report and obtaining ideas for a strategy and starting to meet with people in each development. He related specific information concerning the standing of a few of the properties.

4. **Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Future Neighborhood Designations**

Ms. Abele stated that the list of the top twenty 1950 neighborhoods had been reevaluated in order to select the best candidates. She reported that after comparison, Scottsdale Estates 4 is still the best 1950's John C. Hall neighborhood. Scottsdale Estates 1 through 3 has non-contributing homes, but also brand-new modern houses that impact its eligibility.

In response to a comment by Commissioner Winslow, Ms. Abele explained that Scottsdale Estates 4 was chosen because it was related to John C. Hall, it was brick, and had the architectural character of the Cowboy style ranch homes. Commissioner Winslow opined that the differences between the Scottsdale Estates 4 and the other neighborhoods needed to be made more distinct in order to defend why it is the most appropriate choice for designation.

Ms. Abele noted that of the top twenty, four more have been identified for additional review, and information is being collected on those. In response to a question by Chairman Wimmer, Ms. Abele confirmed that these four are of different architectural styles than the two neighborhoods already on the register. Information on those four will be brought to the next meeting for review.

Ms. Abele mentioned that Sherwood Heights, which is fifth in the original top five list, is representative of custom, upscale, large lot properties with distinctive native landscaping. Information is being collected on two other neighborhoods in this same category. That information will also be brought back for review, in case Sherwood Heights is not chosen. She opined that a representative upscale custom neighborhood should be included in the initial grouping.

Ms. Abele explained that once directed to place Scottsdale Estates 4 on the agenda for initiation, staff would do a mailing in order to allow interested public to attend the hearing, and also tell them about open houses for their neighborhood.

COMMISSIONER HARTZ MOVED THAT SCOTTSDALE ESTATES 4 BE PUT ON THE AGENDA FOR CONSIDERATION OF INITIATION AT AN UPCOMING MEETING. SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER LOCKWOOD, THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF FOUR (4) TO ZERO (0).

5. **Report/Discussion: Progress Report on 5th Avenue Presentation**

Ms. Abele reported that groups that had been identified to be included in the presentation on the history and significance of Fifth Avenue were the Chamber of Commerce and Downtown business interests. Ms. Abele and Commissioner Dallett decided that the presentation should be designed to really capture people's attention and interest. Decision Theatre at ASU has graciously offered use of their facilities free

of charge. A PowerPoint presentation could be shown on their fifty-foot-long screen. A graphic artist has been selected to compile the presentation and Commissioner Dallett and Ms. Abele have started writing an outline. Ms. Abele added that Fifth Avenue business-owners could be a powerful advocate when going before the Council.

Ms. Abele reviewed the ideas she and Commissioner Dallett had for the presentation. The presentation would include historic photographs and bring the audience forward into a depiction of the future. Commissioner Dallett is working on a script for the narration to be read by individual Commissioners, which should be completed by the end of June.

Chairman Wimmer inquired whether anyone in the marketing curriculum at ASU would be interested in further work on this concept, which has value for retailing beyond Arizona. Ms. Abele commented that this is strengthening the relationship between the City of Scottsdale and ASU.

Vice-Chairman Hartz agreed that the idea of involving some of the academic departments at ASU can be developed in several directions, such as urban geography. He commented that Commissioners need to practice running the presentation multiple times before showing it to City Council and the Planning Commission. He stressed that the real goal of the project is not so much a project to remember the history of Fifth Avenue, but to link the memory of that history with the continuation of the look of Fifth Avenue.

Ms. Abele invited everybody in the Commission to participate in creating the presentation, outlining the process she and Commissioner Dallett are following.

Vice-Chairman Hartz reported that after the last meeting he contacted Joan Fudala. She is quite enthused about supporting the project because she is so committed to the preservation of the arts and tourism era of Fifth Avenue. Ms. Fudala will be away for two months, so if they need access to her resources and pictures that needs to be done within the next two weeks. She will continue to work on her Scottsdale projects while away. The photos she used in the PowerPoint presentation for the current exhibition at the Heard Museum North would be very useful and she also has a huge collection of other historical photos.

Commissioner Winslow commented that he is strongly in favor of having City Councilmembers take a tour of the Fifth Avenue area. He noted that with the 360-degree screen in the Decision Theater, one could take a series of coordinated pictures to give the impression that the viewers are right at the location. This could be effective whether or not the participants get a tour of the actual area.

Commissioner Winslow suggested that when they run the presentation for various groups prior to taking it to City Council, the presentation should be followed by a brainstorming session focusing on specific topics. He added that the input should be captured so that the Commission can come back and sort through them and try to make something cohesive out of them.

Chairman Wimmer noted that it can be a challenge to get good audiences together in July and August. Mr. Meserve pointed out that for some of the merchants and retailers the summer is a less busy time and they may be more able to attend. The Commission would then have time to polish the presentation before making it to City Council.

Chairman Wimmer commented that to be successful with City Council, the Commission needs the support of the Chamber of Commerce and the local merchants. He noted that Commissioner Winslow has many times made the key point about the economic engine that is involved here. This should be the fundamental point made to City Council, or the Commission will not be given serious consideration.

Mr. Abele noted that Commissioner Dallett has stressed the importance of meeting with the merchants and becoming conversant with the issues that they are facing. This will give strength and credibility when the Commission goes before City Council. The business people that Ms. Abele has spoken with have been quite receptive.

6. **Committee Reports/Meeting Schedules/Discussion**

- **Community Outreach Committee - Vice-Chairman Hartz**

Vice-Chairman Hartz reported that the walking tour was a good event, with an estimated 60 or so people in attendance. Some people showed up an hour in advance. The event was very successful and the efforts that Mr. Meserve, Joan Fudala and Joann Handley made in leading the tours are greatly appreciated. He also thanked Ms. Lois McFarland for her effective help with getting coverage in the Scottsdale Republic.

Vice-Chairman Hartz added that the Committee will look for opportunities again in the third and fourth quarters to attend history-related and other events and hand out brochures. The Committee is looking to hold another major event maybe in November. This needs further exploration. There have been discussions about organizing a hike to Browns Ranch in October, in collaboration with the McDowell Sonoran Conservancy.

Commissioner Lockwood shared her experience on the Board of Directors for the Arizona Solar Energy Association organizing the solar tour. Having a printed tour guide reinforces the information that the guide presents and is a reference that people can bring home. She volunteered to help produce a tour guide because she created the one for the Solar Energy Association.

Vice-Chairman Hartz noted that some material was available for distribution during the walking tour. He opined that the Historical Preservation Commission ought to work with the Scottsdale Historical Society and their museum to design one single brochure that works for everyone. Discussion ensued on details and how best to present the information. Chairman Wimmer noted that with today's publishing technology, high quality documents can be affordably produced in small quantities and kept completely up to date. Vice-Chairman Hartz stated that the Scottsdale Historical Society has almost no money and the current walking tour guide they distribute is very basic.

Chairman Wimmer suggested that the Outreach Committee should look for sponsorship, which would be an opportunity for the merchants. A well-produced brochure would better reflect Scottsdale. Vice-Chairman Hartz undertook to address this topic, working with the Scottsdale Historical Society.

- **Historic Register Committee - Commissioner Howard**

Ms. Abele noted that the next meeting of the Historic Register Committee will be on May 24, 2006 at 5:00 p.m.

- **Historic Residential Exterior Rehabilitation Committee - Commissioner Winslow**

Commissioner Winslow reported that the next application deadline is June first. Mr. Meserve noted that people are working on applications. Ms. Abele added that staff are also working through on-call technical services for an elderly woman who needed some help in preparing her application and needs wheelchair access to her house.

- **Taliesin West Liaison - Commissioner Dallett**

Mr. Meserve stated he is not aware that a Special Campus (SC) rezoning application for the Taliesin property has been submitted. However, Larry Heiny, the designer, was talking with Commissioner Dallett about what the master plans contained. To date, staff does not have an application or plans to distribute.

Vice-Chairman Hartz noted that when we reprint the arts and tourism brochure, a Taliesin West brochure should be printed at the same time.

7. **Report/Discussion: HPO/Staff Report and Announcements**

Ms. Abele noted that staff usually offers a training session for the Commission once a year. She asked the Commissioners to think about possible topics for training.

Commissioner Winslow suggested reviewing the process of sponsoring historic properties to learn what might have been done differently. He has concerns about the criteria in place when projects, specifically the Valley Ho, were adopted.

Chairman Wimmer agreed that this is a good idea and that Commissioner Winslow could lead the exercise. He noted that commercial considerations may conflict with historic architectural preservation.

Ms. Abele concurred that this could be a useful learning exercise that would help with future projects. Commissioner Winslow suggested that Commissioners draw up a checklist of the issues that they should consider. Vice-Chairman Hartz noted that the Fifth Avenue historic district project will be much more similar to Hotel Valley Ho than to any other project the Commission has tackled.

Chairman Wimmer commented that the Commission tries not to limit creativity to the point that it kills the project, but it must be limited so that it does not degrade the process. Finding the balance is the challenge. Discussion on the Hotel Valley Ho renovation project ensued.

Chairman Wimmer opined that the Commission needs to consider the process and evaluate exactly how the information is received and how much time they have to deliberate. He suggested that one meeting is not enough time to reach a decision. The Commission needs to understand what the impacts are going to be. It would be good to address questions like that in the training.

Mr. Meserve announced that the annual statewide Arizona Preservation Foundation and SHPO conference will be in Glendale from June 15 to 17. The early bird registration deadline is May 13.

Mr. Meserve reported that there have been discussions regarding the rose garden that no longer exists on Fifth Avenue west of Goldwater. New raised beds are to be planted around the Loloma School, which is a city-owned property. The Rose Garden project is proposed to include some armadas and possible abhors. Plans have not been filed with the City yet, but the school is on the Historic Property Register, so when the application is submitted, Ms. Abele and Mr. Randy Grant will determine what the appropriate review process should be. This project may well come to the Commission for review.

Mr. Meserve distributed a copy of an e-mail from Richard Funke, who was responsible for moving the Charles Miller House that used to be on 75th Place north of Thomas to a location on First Street west of Goldwater and restoring the house. He is requesting that the Commission consider putting this property on the Register. From conversations with Mr. Funke, Mr. Meserve commented that Mr. Funke feels like he has not received proper recognition for his efforts and expenditures for moving the Charles Miller House, saving it from demolition, and restoring it. In a separate e-mail, Mr. Funke has offered to give Commissioners or the Historic Register Committee a tour of the property inside and out. Mr. Meserve summarized earlier Commission comments and involvement in the house.

Chairman Wimmer directed the Historic Register Committee to consider this request as an assignment, noting that there are three choices:

- 1 For the Historic Register Committee to come forward with a recommendation of listing.
- 2 For the Historic Register Committee to come forward with a recommendation that the house is not worthy of listing, but perhaps worthy of a letter of commendation and recognition of an effort at urban conservation, as opposed to historic preservation.
- 3 If the Commission does not initiate an action, it is up to the individual who owns the property to initiate HP designation if he wishes. Chairman Wimmer noted that there is cost involved in rezoning applications.

Chairman Wimmer pointed out that Miller Road was named after Charles Miller. The house may have more historic than architectural significance. He asked that the Historic Register Committee consider that the house may be related to a significant person.

Mr. Meserve advised that before the house was moved and when it was threatened with demolition, the city did a Building Condition Assessment (BCA) report on the house to try to determine what additions may have occurred or how it might have been altered over the decades. He will provide copies of Jeff McCall's BCA report on the Charles Miller house for the Historic Register Committee.

8. **Commissioner Comments and Announcements**

None.

9. **Public Comments**

None.

10. **Future Meetings and Agenda Items**

Ms. Abele asked Commissioners to consider when to schedule the next meeting. Vice-Chairman Hartz noted that since the Commission now has to be available for certificate of appropriateness applications, the Commission, at least theoretically, has to be available to meet every month. Mr. Meserve clarified that by Ordinance once staff receive a complete application for a certificate, a hearing date must be set within 30 days.

Chairman Wimmer requested that all Commissioners inform staff of their summer vacation schedules to ensure a quorum during the summer meetings.

11. **Adjournment**

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting was adjourned at 7:01 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
A/V Tronics, Inc.